

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study

Detective stories have always been able to draw much attention from readers all over the world. This attention is drawn from how the readers are involved in solving the case and gathering the clues along with the characters, the imagination that is being built throughout the whole book, or even – for researchers or literature enthusiasts – the way the writer tells the tales. Many detective stories involve problem solving whether it is from a crime, mysterious events, missing people, or many other similar cases. These stories are able to stimulate the readers' brains to form their own theories and images in order to 'help' solve the problems. There have been many detective stories out there, but the root of these stories first began in Europe. Hence, fictional detectives specifically European detectives such as Sherlock Holmes, *Monsieur Lecoq*, Hercule Poirot, and Auguste Dupin are quite popular amongst mystery novels enthusiasts.

Among these European detectives—Sherlock Holmes, *Monsieur Lecoq*, Hercule Poirot, and Auguste Dupin, it can be found that these characters have some sort of connection between one another. This fine line of connection throughout the years can be found either it is from the author's statement, or it can be found in the fictional characters themselves. Take Sherlock Holmes as a character for example. This line of connection can be found when Sherlock Holmes specifically mentioned *Monsieur Lecoq* and Auguste Dupin in a book titled *A Study in Scarlet* (Doyle,

1887:20-21). During a conversation with Dr. Watson, Holmes specifically mentioned these two detectives and stated his opinion regarding these detectives.

Sherlock Holmes is a detective character that first appeared in a book titled *A Study in Scarlet*, published in 1887. Sherlock Holmes has become the world's most renowned detective due to his popularity amongst detective enthusiasts and literature critics. Some of his tales have even been adapted into movies and TV series forms – *Sherlock Holmes* (2009), *Sherlock Holmes: A Game of Shadows* (2011), the upcoming *Sherlock Holmes*, and *Sherlock* (2010). Sherlock Holmes is described as an excellent detective who excels in chemistry, anatomy, and fond of doing other forms of research, despite his job as a consultant detective. His simple – yet effective – deductive method helps in solving many difficult cases and *A Study in Scarlet* is one of them, where Sherlock Holmes gets the chance to solve a homicide of Enoch J. Drebber. In creating Sherlock Holmes, Sir Arthur Conan Doyle admits that he was influenced by the other two detectives that came before Sherlock Holmes, hence in *A Study in Scarlet*, Sherlock Holmes mentioned the names of Auguste Dupin and *Monsieur* Lecoq during his dialogue with his sidekick, Dr. Watson.

All of these detectives are rooted in Edgar Allan Poe's Auguste Dupin. Edgar Allan Poe's Auguste Dupin is the first detective character that has ever been created. Hence, Auguste Dupin earned the title of 'The Father of Detective Stories'. Even Sir Arthur Conan Doyle admitted that in creating the character Sherlock Holmes, Edgar Allan Poe's Auguste Dupin was his inspiration. Based on the research titled *Approaching the Dupin-Holmes (or Poe-Doyle) Controversy* written by Beatriz

Gonzales, it is stated that Edgar Allan Poe inspired Sir Arthur Conan Doyle to create his number one detective, Sherlock Holmes (Gonzales, 2010:59). The inspiration of Auguste Dupin in Sherlock Holmes can also be spotted in their very first story, “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and *A Study in Scarlet*. Auguste Dupin first appeared in a short story titled “The Murders in Rue Morgue”, published in 1841. This short story later becomes the role model of the other detective stories that have ever existed. In “The Murders in Rue Morgue”, Auguste Dupin is described as being able to tell an event in a chronologically. This remarkable skill deserves to be recognized, knowing that Auguste Dupin is not a real detective, rather he is a French non-professional detective. Yet, his deductive skill has led him to solve such a hard homicide case as what has been written in “The Murders in Rue Morgue”.

Because all of the detectives mentioned before rooted back in Auguste Dupin as the first detective character, therefore the analysis on this study focuses on analyzing *A Study in Scarlet* and “The Murders in Rue Morgue”. The reason behind this is because Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, himself, states that in making the character Sherlock Holmes, he was influenced by Edgar Allan Poe’s Auguste Dupin by saying that his detective – Auguste Dupin – is the best detective in fiction (Gonzales, 2010:59). Hence, this study focuses on comparing the characters, settings, and plot of “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and *A Study in Scarlet*.

1.2 Research Problems

1. What are the similarities and differences in the characterization of Sherlock Holmes and Auguste Dupin as well as their sidekicks?

2. What are the similarities and differences that can be found in the settings of *A Study in Scarlet* based on “The Murders in Rue Morgue”?
3. What are the similarities and differences that can be found in the plot of *A Study in Scarlet* based on “The Murders in Rue Morgue”?

1.3 Objectives of the Study

1. To analyze the similarities and differences in the characterization of Sherlock Holmes and Auguste Dupin as well as their sidekicks.
2. To analyze the similarities and differences that can be found in the settings of *A Study in Scarlet* based on the settings of “The Murders in Rue Morgue”.
3. To analyze the similarities and differences that can be found in the plot of *A Study in Scarlet* based on the plot of “The Murders in Rue Morgue”.

1.4 Previous Studies

As mentioned before, the tale of Sherlock Holmes is well-known to everybody. Meaning that there have already been multiple researches regarding the stories or even the character. The previous studies that are being used in this research are the ones that are related to the topic of discussion, regarding comparison between Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s Sherlock Holmes and Edgar Allan Poe’s Auguste Dupin.

The first study is titled *A Descent into Edgar Allan Poe and His Works: The Bicentennial* written by Beatriz Gonzalez (2010). The study mainly focuses about interpreting and analyzing Edgar Allan Poe’s works, but in this study, there is one part that specifically discusses regarding the controversy between Edgar Allan Poe’s Auguste Dupin and Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s Sherlock Holmes. From this

part, it can also be seen that it is trying to prove that Sir Arthur Conan Doyle is not just merely plagiarizing Edgar Allan Poe's work instead, Sir Arthur Conan Doyle took the inspiration from Edgar Allan Poe and implemented his own into making the character Sherlock Holmes, stating, "...Conan Doyle was accused of paying little, if any, tribute to Edgar Allan Poe. From the beginning, critics started to pinpoint Poe's influence on the British writer but, for many, those 'influences' turned Conan Doyle into an ungrateful plagiarist" (Gonzalez, 2010:59-60). Based on the following quotation, it can be concluded that some critiques accused Conan Doyle as a plagiarist regarding the similarities that are found in both *A Study in Scarlet* – which Conan Doyle wrote, and "The Murders in Rue Morgue" – which Edgar Allan Poe wrote. While in contradiction, as what Conan Doyle has stated that he was influenced by Edgar Allan Poe, in which these influences are being the main focus of this study and being discussed further to see how Conan Doyle adapts and transforms some of the ideas he takes from Edgar Allan Poe's "The Murders in Rue Morgue" into his own story which is *A Study in Scarlet*. Hence, this study mainly focuses on *A Study in Scarlet* and "The Murders in Rue Morgue" only.

The second study is titled *The Psychology of "The Murders in Rue Morgue"* written by Leo Lemay (1982). In this study, Lemay puts the interest of the study on solving and analyzing the psychological aspects of Auguste Dupin in the short story "The Murders in Rue Morgue". Lemay intends to give explanation towards the paradoxes found in the conclusion part of "The Murders in Rue Morgue". This study begins by explaining and analyzing the final dialogue mentioned by Dupin saying, "I believe that if we fully understand the ways that these three metaphors-

and the final quotation- complement the story, then we will understand the psychology of "The Murders in the Rue Morgue." (Lemay, 1982:165). The way this study explains in such detailed analysis by focusing in those metaphors deepens and further aids in understanding how Auguste Dupin formed his 'train of thoughts' of solving the case.

The third study is titled *Detection, Imagination, and the Introduction to "The Murders in Rue Morgue"* written by Terry J. Martin (1989). The main focus of this study is analyzing how Edgar Allan Poe defines the word 'analysis' and how Poe challenges the historical assumption that analysis is just merely a mathematical process (Martin, 1989:31). In this previous study, it is also stated that Poe challenges the readers to get involved in the story and also doing analysis by their own, that is to be skeptical of superficial truths and alive to the metaphorical potential of a language through one of his books, "The Murders in Rue Morgue".

The fourth study is titled *Side by Side: The Role of Sidekick* written by Ron Buchanan (2003). The main focus of this study is to analyze the sidekicks in general. Either it is from their roles in the many different scenarios or how important they are to be present in the story. This previous study claims that a sidekick is crucial to the development of the story in order to assist the central character and to act as a surrogate for the audience.

Similarly, Dr. Watson accompanies Sherlock Holmes in his adventures, but while Watson occasionally contributes a weapon (as in *The Red-Headed League*) or summons the police, he does not solve the mystery or contribute significant clues to resolve the dilemma the pair faces (Buchanan, 2003:16-17).

Based on the statement above, this previous study focuses in analyzing the role of Dr. Watson as Sherlock Holmes' sidekick in solving the mysteries that they have to face. This previous study is still very broad in terms of the objects of the study, however, it also aids this study in understanding more of Dr. Watson as a character, as well as Sherlock Holmes through the perspective of Dr. Watson.

1.5 Scope of the Study

This study focuses its analysis on comparing “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and *A Study in Scarlet* and finding the similarities as well as the differences in terms of their characters, settings, and plot. The main topic of this study is to find the textual modifications that Sir Arthur Conan Doyle makes in composing *A Study in Scarlet* that are taken from Edgar Allan Poe's “The Murders in Rue Morgue”. This point of interest is taken due to the statement that Doyle made in an interview stating that in creating the character Sherlock Holmes, Dupin is indeed inspired by Edgar Allan Poe's Auguste Dupin (Gonzales, 2010:59). Hence, in order to find this inspiration, this study limits its topic to only analyzing the detective and sidekick characters in both stories, the settings, and the plot.

There have been many researches that talk regarding this topic, however, this study limits its focus only on analyzing the first two fictions, where both Auguste Dupin and Sherlock Holmes first appeared. Hence, it is chosen that the objects of this study are “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and *A Study in Scarlet*. These objects are also chosen because Holmes specifically mentioned Auguste Dupin in *A Study in Scarlet*. Hence, by comparing these two literary works, it can be observed that

Doyle adapts the idea taken from Poe and transforms those ideas to make his own story, which is *A Study in Scarlet*.

1.6 Organization of the Writing

The thesis will be arranged in the following chapters and sub-chapters:

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter contains Background of the Study, Research Problems, Objectives of the Study, and Organization of the Writing.

CHAPTER 2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This chapter contains information regarding the theories which are needed to analyze the novel in accordance with the research problems and purpose of study. The theories that are being used in this study are characters, characterization, settings, plot, comparative literature, and intertextuality. In this chapter also contains the research methods that are being used in order to compose this thesis.

CHAPTER 3 COMPARATIVE STUDY ON EDGAR ALLAN POE’S “THE MURDERS IN RUE MORGUE” AND SIR ARTHUR CONAN DOYLE’S *A STUDY IN SCARLET*

This chapter contains the thesis’ analysis which is coherence with the theoretical framework. The content of this chapter discusses about the similarities and differences that can be observed in Auguste Dupin and the narrator “I” towards Sherlock Holmes and Dr. Watson as characters that can be observed in their habits, characterization, and their method of deductions, specifically for the detective

characters. In this chapter also discusses the modifications or changes made by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle in *A Study in Scarlet* that refers to Edgar Allan Poe's "The Murders in Rue Morgue".

CHAPTER 4 CONCLUSION

This chapter contains the conclusion of the thesis' analysis.

BIBLIOGRAPHY