



**COMPARATIVE STUDY ON EDGAR ALLAN POE'S "THE MURDERS
IN RUE MORGUE" AND SIR ARTHUR CONAN DOYLE'S *A STUDY IN
SCARLET***

A THESIS

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for S-1 Degree

Majoring Literature in English Department Faculty of Humanities

Diponegoro University

Submitted by:

Yuan Forevers Kuada

13020119130039

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES

DIPONEGORO UNIVERSITY

SEMARANG

2023

PRONOUNCEMENT

The writer sincerely states that this research is conducted without taking any other materials that have been used before as a form of plagiarism. The following citations and quotations have been included with their sources. Furthermore, the writer assures that the writer did not utilize materials from other published words of others, except for the references explicitly cited in the bibliography.

Semarang, 5 December 2023

Yuan Forevers Kuada

MOTTO AND DEDICATION

“Crime is common. Logic is rare.”

Sherlock Holmes

“But I say unto you, love your enemies, bless them that curse you, do good to them that hate you, and pray for them which despitefully use you, and persecute you.”

Jesus of Nazareth

This thesis is dedicated to

My beloved family, friends, loved ones

and my dreams

APPROVAL

**COMPARATIVE STUDY ON EDGAR ALLAN POE'S "THE MURDERS
IN RUE MORGUE" AND SIR ARTHUR CONAN DOYLE'S *A STUDY IN
SCARLET***

Written By:

Yuan Forevers Kuada
NIM: 13020119130039

Is approved by the thesis advisor
on 6 December 2023

Thesis Advisor



Eta Farmacelia Nurulhady, S.S., M.Hum., M.A., Ph.D.
NIP.197205292003122001

The Head of English Department



Dr. Oktiva Herry Chandra M.Hum.
NIP.196710041993031003

VALIDATION

**COMPARATIVE STUDY ON EDGAR ALLAN POE'S "THE MURDERS
IN RUE MORGUE" AND SIR ARTHUR CONAN DOYLE'S *A STUDY IN
SCARLET***

Submitted by:

Yuan Forevers Kuada

13020119130039

Approved by

Strata I Thesis Examination Committee
Faculty of Humanities Diponegoro University

on December 2023

Thesis Advisor

Eta Farmacelia Nurulhady, S.S., M.Hum., M.A., Ph.D.

NIP.197205292003122001

Chairman

Dr. Ratna Asmarani, M.Ed., M.Hum.

NIP.196102261987032001

Member

Hadiyanto, S.S., M.Hum.

NIP.197908222008012013



Accepted and declared in Semarang on December 2023

The Dean of Faculty of Humanities



ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Praise be to God, The Father, The Son, and The Holy Spirit, who has bestowed the writer the strength and held the writer's hand throughout this journey on writing this thesis, enabling the successful completion of this thesis titled "Comparative Study on Edgar Allan Poe's "The Murders in Rue Morgue" and Sir Arthur Conan Doyle's *A Study in Scarlet*." The writer also would like to express a heartfelt gratitude to all of the individuals who have contributed as well as helped the writer in the fulfillment of this thesis.

Special recognition and sincere appreciation are extended to Eta Farmacelia Nurulhady, S.S., M.Hum., M.A., Ph.D., the esteemed advisor, who has provided the writer brilliant suggestions, insightful advice, and detailed corrections throughout the process of writing this thesis, that without her guidance, the writer doubt that this thesis would be completed.

The writer's deepest thanks also goes to the following:

1. Dr. Nurhayati, M.Hum. as the Dean of Faculty of Humanities Diponegoro University.
2. Dr. Drs. Oktiva Herry Candra, M.Hum. as the chairman of English Department, Faculty of Humanities Diponegoro University

3. All of the distinguished lecturers in the English Department, Faculty of Humanities Diponegoro University who have shared their precious knowledge and experiences throughout the writer's college life.
4. The writer's family who motivates the writer to finish this thesis every day.
5. Deva Alviana Larasati who accompanies the writer, listens to every grievance, as well as motivates the writer to graduate together. Thank you very much, although she said that she did not do much, but she helped to keep the writer sane.
6. The Tods, Muhammad Arif Wicaksono, Iqbal Rifki Cahyo, Ahmad Azril Fadhilah, Rio El Asa, Ariyudha Bektu Nugroho, who would also be there if the writer was feeling burnt out and asked to play a game together or go to a Japanese festival together.
7. Muhammad Salman Setiawan and his family at "Laris Manis" food stall who provides food whenever the writer is outside.
8. Cindy and Bella who have the same advisor as the writer and who accompany the writer as well as fight together to graduate together.
9. Dionisius Krisna who also provides guidance to the writer on what to do when the writer is in panic.
10. Hoshimachi Suisei, Gawr Gura, Koseki Bijou, and Vestia Zeta from the Hololive talent group, who accompanied the writer along during late night work on this thesis with their calming, funny, and amusing livestreams.

The writer humbly acknowledges that this thesis is not without its imperfections. Consequently, the writer welcomes and greatly appreciates any

constructive criticism and recommendations that can contribute to the improvement of this thesis. Hence, the writer earnestly that this thesis will prove beneficial to readers seeking to gain insights on comparing between “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and *A Study in Scarlet*.

Semarang, 5 December 2023

Yuan Forevers Kuada

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TITLE.....	i
PRONOUNCEMENT	ii
MOTTO AND DEDICATION	iii
APPROVAL	iv
VALIDATION.....	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	vi
TABLE OF CONTENT	ix
ABSTRACT.....	xii
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of the Study	1
1.2 Research Problems.....	3
1.3 Objectives of the Study.....	4
1.4 Previous Studies	4
1.5 Scope of the Study	7
1.6 Organization of Writing	8
CHAPTER 2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK.....	12
2.1 Theoretical Framework.....	11
2.1.1 Narrative elements of Fiction.....	11
2.1.1.1 Characters and Characterization.....	11

	2.1.1.2 Settings	12
	2.1.1.3 Plot.....	13
	2.1.2 Comparative Literature and Intertextuality	14
	2.2 Methods of the Study	17
CHAPTER 3	Comparative Study on Edgar Allan Poe’s “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s <i>A Study in Scarlet</i>	19
	3.1 Narrative Elements of Edgar Allan Poe’s “The Murders in Rue Morgue”	19
	3.1.1 Auguste Dupin and the Narrator “I”	20
	3.1.2 Settings of “The Murders in Rue Morgue”	23
	3.1.3 Plot of “The Murders in Rue Morgue”	26
	3.2 Narrative Elements of Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s <i>A Study in Scarlet</i>	30
	3.2.1 Sherlock Holmes and Dr. Watson.....	30
	3.2.2 Settings of <i>A Study in Scarlet</i>	34
	3.2.3 Plot of <i>A Study in Scarlet</i>	37
	3.3 Comparative Study on Edgar Allan Poe’s “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s <i>A Study in Scarlet</i> .	41
	3.3.1 Comparison Between Auguste Dupin and the Narrator “I” to Sherlock Holmes and Dr. Watson.....	41
	3.3.2 Comparison Between the Settings of “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and <i>A Study in Scarlet</i>	54

3.3.3 Comparison Between the Plot of “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and <i>A Study in Scarlet</i>	58
CHAPTER 4 CONCLUSION.....	65
BIBLIOGRAPHY	67

ABSTRACT

This study analyses two different detective fictions, the first one is a short story written by Edgar Allan Poe entitled “The Murders in Rue Morgue”; and the second is a novel written by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle entitled *A Study in Scarlet*. This study aims to analyse the similarities and differences found in the characters, settings, and plot used in both fictions by comparing both literary works. The theories that are being used in this study are the comparative literature theory and intertextuality theory. The data used in this study is gathered by using the qualitative research method as well as library research. The result shows that there are indeed some similarities and also differences found in “The Murders in Rue Morgue” and *A Study in Scarlet* in terms of their characters, settings, and plot.

Keywords: detective fictions, characters, settings, plot, comparing, intertextuality.